



Khutbah 24/07/09 Dhikr openly and secretly

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ نَحْمَدُهُ وَنَسْتَغْفِرُهُ وَنَسْتَعِينُهُ وَنُؤْمِنُ بِهِ وَنَتَوَكَّلُ عَلَيْهِ ،
وَنَعُوذُ بِاللَّهِ مِنْ شُرُورِ أَنْفُسِنَا وَسَيِّئَاتِ أَعْمَالِنَا ،
مَنْ يَهْدِ اللَّهُ فَهُوَ الْمُهْتَدِ ، وَمَنْ يُضِلِّ فَلَا هَادِيَ لَهُ ،
وَأَشْهَدُ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَحْدَهُ لَا شَرِيكَ لَهُ ، لَهُ الْمُلْكُ وَلَهُ الْحَمْدُ ،
يُحْيِي وَيُمِيتُ ، بِيَدِهِ الْخَيْرُ ، وَهُوَ عَلَى كُلِّ شَيْءٍ قَدِيرٌ . وَأَشْهَدُ أَنَّ
مُحَمَّدًا عَبْدُهُ وَرَسُولُهُ ، أَرْسَلَهُ بِدِينِ الْحَقِّ بَشِيرًا وَنَذِيرًا ، بَيْنَ يَدَيْ
السَّاعَةِ ، صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَعَلَى آلِهِ وَصَحْبِهِ وَمَنْ تَبِعَهُمْ بِإِحْسَانٍ
إِلَى يَوْمِ الدِّينِ .

أَمَّا بَعْدُ ، فَأَوْصِيكُمْ وَإِيَّايَ بِتَقْوَا اللَّهِ وَأُحْذِرْكُمْ وَإِيَّايَ عَنِ مَعْصِيَتِهِ
تَارِيخُ الْيَوْمِ الْأَوَّلِ مِنْ شَعْبَانَ السَّنَةِ أَلْفَ وَأَرْبَعِ مِائَةٍ وَثَلَاثِينَ

We will look for the moon on the evening of Friday the 21st August because Friday corresponds to the 29th of Sha'bān, so that the 1st of Ramadan must either be Saturday the 22nd August or Sunday the 23rd.

قال سبحانه وتعالى في كتابه العزيز، بعد أَعُوذُ بِاللَّهِ مِنَ الشَّيْطَانِ
الرَّجِيمِ :

﴿وَاذْكُرْ رَبَّكَ فِي نَفْسِكَ تَضَرُّعًا وَخِيفَةً وَدُونَ الْجَهْرِ مِنَ الْقَوْلِ بِالْغُدُوِّ

﴿ 205 ﴾ وَالْأَصَالِ وَلَا تَكُنْ مِنَ الْغَافِلِينَ

Allah ﷻ said, that which means:

205 Remember your Lord in yourself

humbly and fearfully,

without loudness of voice,

morning and evening.

Do not be one of the unaware.

﴿ واذكر ربك في نفسك ﴾ يحتمل أن يريدَ الذِّكْرَ بِالْقَلْبِ دون اللسان أو الذِّكْرَ بِاللِّسَانِ سِرًّا، فأعلى حدِّ السِّرِّ أن تُسْمِعَ نَفْسَكَ، وأدنى حدِّ الجَهْرِ أن تُسْمِعَ مَنْ يَلِيكَ

“Remember your Lord in yourself” can mean remembrance in the heart without the tongue, or it can dhikr with the tongue secretly. The loudest level of secret dhikr is that you can hear yourself, and the lowest level of dhikr done aloud is that the person next to you can hear you, as is the case in the prayer.

﴿ ودون الجهر من القول ﴾ أي: متكلماً كلاماً فوق السر ودون الجهر، فإنه أُدْخِلَ فِي الخشوع والإخلاص، ولا حجة فيه لمن منع الذِّكْرَ جَهْرًا؛ لأن الآية مكيةٌ حين كان الكفر غالباً، فكانوا يسبون الذِّكْرَ والمذكور، ولما هاجر المصطفى - عليه الصلاة والسلام - إلى المدينة، جهر الصحابةُ بالتكبير والذِّكْرَ. فالآية منسوخة.

“without loudness of voice” Shaykh Ibn ‘Ajībah said: i.e. speaking in a way that is above secrecy but less than being out loud, because that leads to humility and sincerity. There is no proof in it for those who prohibit dhikr done aloud because the āyah is Makkan where the kuffār were dominant and they used to abuse dhikr and the One Who is remembered.

When the Mustafa ﷺ emigrated to Madīnah, the Companions raised their voices in takbīr and dhikr, so that the āyah is abrogated.

﴿ بِالْغَدُوِّ وَالْأَصَالِ ﴾ أَي فِي الصَّبَاحِ وَالْعَشِيِّ وَالْأَصَالِ جَمْعُ أُصْلٍ
وَالْأُصْلُ جَمْعُ أَصِيلٍ قِيلَ الْمُرَادُ صَلَاةَ الصَّبْحِ وَالْعَصْرِ وَقِيلَ فَرَضَ الْخَمْسَ
وَالْأَظْهَرَ الْإِطْلَاقَ

“morning and evening” it is said that what is meant is the Ṣubḥ and ‘Aṣr prayers, and some have said it is the five prayers, but the most obvious thing is that one should take it in the most general possible sense.

فَإِنْ قُلْتَ: قَالَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى (وَاذْكُرْ رَبَّكَ فِي نَفْسِكَ تَضَرُّعًا وَخَفِيَّةً
وَدُونَ الْجَهْرِ مِنَ الْقَوْلِ) وَهَذَا دَلِيلٌ عَلَى أَنَّ الذِّكْرَ فِي الْجَهْرِ مَمْنُوعٌ،
قُلْتَ: الْجَوَابُ عَنْ هَذِهِ الْآيَةِ مِنْ ثَلَاثَةِ أَوْجِهٍ:

If you say that Allah, exalted is He, said, “Remember your Lord in yourself humbly and fearfully, without loudness of voice” and that this proves that dhikr said aloud is prohibited, then I say that the response to this āyah is threefold”

الأول: إنها مكية كآية الإسراء (وَلَا تَجْهَرُ بِصَلَاتِكَ وَلَا تَخَافُ بِهَا) وَقَدْ
نَزَلَتْ حِينَ كَانَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَجْهَرُ بِالْقُرْآنِ فَيَسْمَعُهُ
الْمُشْرِكُونَ فَيَسُبُونَ الْقُرْآنَ وَمَنْ أَنْزَلَهُ فَأَمَرَ بِتَرْكِ الْجَهْرِ سَدًّا لِلذَّرِيعَةِ
كَمَا نَهَى عَنْ سَبِّ الْأَصْنَامِ لِذَلِكَ فِي قَوْلِهِ تَعَالَى (وَلَا تَسُبُّوا الَّذِينَ
يَدْعُونَ مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ فَيَسُبُّوا اللَّهَ عَدْوًا بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ)

First, that it is Makkan just like the āyah from al-Isrā, “Do not be too loud in your salat or too quiet in it, but try to find a way between the two,” and it was revealed at a time when the Prophet ﷺ used to recite the Qur’ān aloud and the idolators heard it and would abuse the

Qur'ān and the One Who revealed it, and so he was ordered to give up reciting aloud to prevent this result, just as he was prohibited to abuse the idols for the same reason when He, exalted is He, said: “Do not curse those they call upon besides Allah, in case that makes them curse Allah in animosity, without knowledge.”

الثاني: إن جماعة من المفسرين منهم عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم شيخ مالك وابن جرير حملوا الآية على الذاكِر حال قراءة القرآن وانه أمر له بالذكر على هذه الصفة تعظيماً للقرآن أن ترفع عنده الأصوات ويقويه اتصالها بقوله: (وَإِذَا قُرِئَ الْقُرْآنُ فَاسْتَمِعُوا لَهُ وَأَنْصِتُوا لَعَلَّكُمْ تُرْحَمُونَ) قلت: وكأنه لما أمر بالإنصات خشي من ذلك الإخلاد إلى البطالة فنبه على أنه وإن كان مأموراً بالسكوت باللسان إلا أن تكليف الذكر بالقلب باق حتى لا يغفل عن ذكر الله ولذا ختم الآية بقوله (ولا تكن من الغافلين).

Second, that a group of the Qur'ānic commentators among them 'Abd ar-Raḥmān ibn Zayd ibn Aslam the teacher of Imām Malik, and Ibn Jarir at-Tabari interpreted the āyah to refer to someone who is doing dhikr at the same time as the recitation of the Qur'ān, and that it is a command to him to do dhikr in this way, i.e. secretly, in order to exalt the Qur'ān and not to have the voice raised over. This connection is substantiated by His words, “When the Qur'an is recited listen to it and be quiet so that hopefully you will gain mercy.” It is as if that when he was ordered to be silent it was feared that he would continue in inactivity and idleness, and so He alerted us that even if we are ordered to be silent with our tongues yet the obligation and responsibility of remembering Allah with the heart continues so that one does not become neglectful of the remembrance of Allah, and so He concluded the āyah with His words, “And do not be one of the neglectful.”

الثالث: أن الأمر في الآية خاص بالنبي صلى الله عليه وسلم الكامل

المكمل وأما غيره ممن هو محل الوسواس والخواطر الرديئة فمأمور بالجهر لأنه أشد تأثيرا في دفعها. ويؤيده من الحديث ما أخرجه البزار عن معاذ بن جبل قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم من صلى منكم بالليل فليجهر بقراءته فإن الملائكة تصلي بصلاته وتسمع لقراءته وإن مؤمني الجن الذين يكونون في الهواء وجيرانه معه في مَسْكِنِهِ يصلون بصلاته ويستمعون قراءته وأنه يطرد بجهره بقراءته عن داره وعن الدور التي حوله فساق الجن ومردة الشياطين

Third, that the command in the āyāt is particularly for the Prophet ﷺ who was perfect. But as for other people who are full of whisperings and thoughts, they are ordered to do dhikr aloud because it is more effective in driving those things away. That is supported by what the ḥadīth narrated by al-Bazzar from Mu‘ādh ibn Jabal ؓ who said: The Messenger of Allah ﷺ said, “Whoever of you prays at night should recite aloud for the angels pray behind him in his prayer and listen to his recitation, and the believing Jinn, the ones who are in the air, and his neighbours who are with him in his house pray along with his prayer, and listen to his recitation, and he will drive away the deviant jinn and the insolent shaytans from his house and neighbouring houses by means of his reciting aloud.

أَقُولُ قَوْلِي هَذَا وَأَسْتَغْفِرُ اللَّهَ لِي وَلِكُمْ وَلِسَائِرِ الْمُسْلِمِينَ فَاسْتَغْفِرُوهُ إِنَّهُ هُوَ الْغَفُورُ الرَّحِيمُ

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ وَالصَّلَاةُ وَالسَّلَامُ عَلَى مَنْ لَا نَبِيَّ بَعْدَهُ،
 أُوصِيكُمْ بِتَقْوَا اللَّهِ وَطَاعَتِهِ، وَأُحَذِّرُكُمْ عَنْ مَعْصِيَتِهِ وَمُخَالَفَتِهِ. فَاتَّقُوا
 اللَّهَ فِيمَا أَمَرَ، وَأَنْتَهُوا عَمَّا نَهَى عَنْهُ وَزَجَرَ.
 قال تعالى:

فَمَنْ يَعْمَلْ مِثْقَالَ ذَرَّةٍ خَيْرًا يَرَهُ ﴿7﴾ وَمَنْ يَعْمَلْ مِثْقَالَ ذَرَّةٍ شَرًّا يَرَهُ

﴿8﴾

أَمَّا بَعْدُ:

أخرج أحمد وأبو يعلى وكذا ابن حبان والحاكم وصحاحه
 والبيهقي في شعب الإيمان عن أبي سعيد الخدري قال: قال رسول
 الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ﴿أَكْثَرُوا ذِكْرَ اللَّهِ حَتَّى يَقُولُوا
 مَجْنُونٌ﴾ وفي رواية للبيهقي ﴿... حَتَّى يَقُولَ الْمُنَافِقُونَ أَنَّكُمْ
 مُرَاؤُونَ﴾

ووجه الدلالة من هذا أن ذلك إنما يقال عند الجهر دون الإسرار.

Imām Aḥmad, Abū Ya'lā, and Ibn Ḥibbān and al-Ḥākim who both declared it to be ṣaḥīḥ, as well as al-Bayhaqī narrated from Abū Sa'īd al-Khudrī who said: The Messenger of Allah ﷺ said, "Do a great deal of dhikr of Allah until they say, 'Mad.'" And in another narration from al-Bayhaqī there is, "...until they say that you are showing off."

But it is clear that this will only be said if one does dhikr openly rather than if one does it secretly.

وفي فضل ذكر الله سرّاً الحديث الذي رواه الإمام أحمد والبيهقي عن
سعد رضي الله عنه

﴿ خير الذكر الخفي وخير الرزق ما كفى ﴾ (وفي المنتخب ما يكفي) .

As to the merits of dhikr done secretly there is the ḥadīth narrated by Imām Aḥmad and al-Bayhaqi:

“The best dhikr is that which is hidden and the best provision is what is sufficient.”

عَنْ أَبِي مُوسَى قَالَ كُنَّا مَعَ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي سَفَرٍ فَكُنَّا إِذَا
عَلَوْنَا كَبَّرْنَا فَقَالَ ارْبَعُوا عَلَيَّ أَنْفُسِكُمْ فَإِنَّكُمْ لَا تَدْعُونَ أَصَمَّ وَلَا غَائِبًا
تَدْعُونَ سَمِيعًا بَصِيرًا قَرِيبًا

Abū Mūsā رضي الله عنه said: We were with the Prophet صلى الله عليه وسلم on a journey, and when we ascended we would say the takbīr, so he said, “Be gentle to yourselves, for you are not calling on one who is deaf nor one who is absent; you are calling on One Who is All-Hearing, All-Seeing and Near.”

This understanding of the nearness of Allah, exalted is He, is the reason for the reminder here for the Arabs distinguish between calling on one who is near, which is called *du‘ā* and calling on someone who is far away, which is called *nidā’*, and the *adhān* is an example of the latter.

But lest people think that dhikr aloud is not permitted, let us look at some more of the evidence.

أخرج الشيخان عن ابن عباس قال إن رفع الصوت بالذكر حين
ينصرف الناس من المكتوبة كان على عهد النبي صلى الله عليه
وسلم قال ابن عباس كنت أعلم إذا انصرفوا بذلك إذا سمعته .

The two Shaykhs, al-Bukhārī and Muslim, narrated that Ibn ‘Abbās ؓ said, “They used to raise their voices when people finished the obligatory prayer at the time of the Prophet ﷺ.” Ibn ‘Abbās said, “I used to know when they had finished when I heard it.”

أخرج أحمد وأبو داود والترمذي وصححه والنسائي وابن ماجه عن
السائب أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال جاءني جبريل فقال
مر أصحابك يرفعوا أصواتهم بالتكبير.

Aḥmad, Abū Dāwūd, and at-Tirmidhī who declared it ṣaḥīḥ, and an-Nasā’ī and Ibn Mājah narrated from as-Sā’ib that the Messenger of Allah ﷺ said, “Jibril came to me and said: ‘Tell your Companions to raise their voices in takbīr.’”

قال السيوطي رحمه الله: إذا تأملت ما أوردنا من الأحاديث عرفت
من مجموعها أنه لا كراهة البتة في الجهر بالذكر بل فيه ما يدل
على استحبابه إما صريحا أو التزاما كما أشرنا إليه، وأما معارضته
بحدِيث ﴿خير الذكر الخفي﴾ فهو نظير معارضة أحاديث الجهر
بالقرآن بحدِيث ﴿المسرُّ بالقرآن كالمسرِّ بالصدقة﴾، وقد جمع
النووي بينهما بأن الإخفاء أفضل حيث خاف الرياء أو تأذى به
مصلون أو نيام، والجهر أفضل في غير ذلك لأن العمل فيه أكثر
ولأن فائدته تتعدى إلى السامعين ولأنه يوقظ قلب القارئ ويجمع
همه إلى الفكر ويصرف سمعه إليه ويطرد النوم ويزيد في النشاط،
وقال بعضهم: يستحب الجهر ببعض القراءة والإسرار ببعضها لأن
المسرِّ قد يملُّ فيأنس بالجهر والجاهر قد يكلُّ فيستريح بالإسرار

انتهى

وكذلك نقول في الذكر على هذا التفصيل وبه يحصل الجمع بين

الأحاديث

As-Suyūṭī, may Allah be merciful to him, said: If you consider those ḥadīth we have narrated you will recognise from that collection that there is nothing disliked at all in doing dhikr aloud, but on the contrary there is that in this collection which shows that it is recommended either explicitly or implicitly as we have indicated. As for opposing it with the ḥadīth, “The best dhikr is that which is hidden,” that is like opposing the ḥadīth about reciting the Qur’ān aloud with the ḥadīth, “The one who recites the Qur’ān secretly is like someone who gives ṣadaqah secretly.” An-Nawawī reconciled both of these by saying that concealing the recitation is better if one is afraid of showing-off or disturbing people at prayer or people who are sleeping, but reciting aloud is better elsewhere because there is more work in it and because the benefit in it extends to those who hear it, and because it awakens the heart of the recite and unites his concerns in reflection, and diverts his hearing to it, and drives sleep away and increases him in activity. One man said: It is preferred to recite aloud for some of recitation and to recite secretly for some because the person reciting secretly may become bored and like to listen to that recited aloud, and the person reciting aloud may become tired and so find rest in reciting secretly.”

Similarly, we say about dhikr with the same detailed explanation and it is in this way that we can reconcile the different ḥadīth.

إِنَّ اللَّهَ وَمَلَائِكَتَهُ يُصَلُّونَ عَلَى النَّبِيِّ ، يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا صَلُّوا عَلَيْهِ
وَسَلِّمُوا تَسْلِيمًا
اللَّهُمَّ صَلِّ عَلَى سَيِّدِنَا مُحَمَّدٍ وَعَلَى آلِهِ وَصَحْبِهِ وَسَلَّمَ تَسْلِيمًا

وَارْضَ اللَّهُمَّ عَنِ الْخُلَفَاءِ الرَّاشِدِينَ أَبِي بَكْرٍ وَعُمَرَ وَعُثْمَانَ وَعَلِيٍّ ،
وَسَائِرِ الصَّحَابَةِ خُصُوصاً الْمُهَاجِرِينَ مِنْهُمْ وَالْأَنْصَارِ وَالتَّابِعِينَ لَهُمْ وَتَابِعِي
التَّابِعِينَ وَمَنْ تَبِعَهُمْ إِلَى يَوْمِ الدِّينِ .

اللَّهُمَّ اهْدِ وِلَاةَ أُمُورِ الْمُسْلِمِينَ لِمَا يُرْضِيكَ وَلَا تَبَاعِ سُنَّةَ مُحَمَّدٍ ﷺ

اللَّهُمَّ أَعِزِّ الْإِسْلَامَ وَالْمُسْلِمِينَ ، وَاخْذُلِ الْكُفْرَ وَالْكَافِرِينَ ، وَانصُرِ
المُجَاهِدِينَ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ ، وَاجْعَلْ كَلِمَتَكَ هِيَ الْعُلَا ، وَكَلِمَةَ الْكُفْرِ
هِيَ السُّفْلَى

رَبَّنَا اغْفِرْ لَنَا وَلِإِخْوَانِنَا الَّذِينَ سَبَقُونَا بِالْإِيمَانِ وَلَا تَجْعَلْ فِي قُلُوبِنَا غِلًّا
لِلَّذِينَ آمَنُوا ۝ رَبَّنَا إِنَّكَ رَؤُوفٌ رَحِيمٌ

رَبَّنَا آتِنَا مِنْ لَدُنْكَ رَحْمَةً وَهَيِّئْ لَنَا مِنْ أَمْرِنَا رَشَدًا

رَبَّنَا آتِنَا فِي الدُّنْيَا حَسَنَةً وَفِي الْآخِرَةِ حَسَنَةً وَقِنَا عَذَابَ النَّارِ

رَبَّنَا هَبْ لَنَا مِنْ أَزْوَاجِنَا وَذُرِّيَّاتِنَا قُرَّةَ أَعْيُنٍ وَاجْعَلْنَا لِلْمُتَّقِينَ إِمَامًا

إِنَّ الصَّلَاةَ تَنْهَى عَنِ الْفَحْشَاءِ وَالْمُنْكَرِ

وَلَذِكْرُ اللَّهِ أَكْبَرُ

يَعْظُمُكُمْ لِعَلَّكُمْ تَذَكَّرُونَ

وَقُومُوا إِلَى صَلَاتِكُمْ يَرْحَمُكُمُ اللَّهُ